Excellence in Mentorship – 10 years on

Dr Kathleen Duffy
Nursing and Midwifery Practice Educator
NHS Education for Scotland
/NHS Lanarkshire

kathleen.duffy@nes.scot.nhs.uk
Duffy, 2006

“Weighing the Balance: A grounded theory study of the factors that influence the decisions regarding the assessment of students’ competence in practice.”
NMC Scholarship Report, 2003

Failing Students: A Qualitative Study of Factors that Influence the Decisions Regarding the Assessment of Students’ Competence in Practice

Kathleen Duffy

School of Nursing, Midwifery & Community Health

Glasgow Caledonian University
Recommendations

Mentorship preparation
Include the topic of:

• dealing with a failed clinical assessment
• dealing with practical aspects and emotional reactions
• the formal processes

Failure early in the programme preferable to failure later in the programme
Recommendations

Nurse Education Programmes

• Tripartite arrangements to support mentors in their clinical assessment role
• Lecturers have a role in clinical assessment
• Debriefing with mentors after a failed assessment
• Passing on of information between placements
• Learning outcomes pertinent to professional behaviour and attitude be given prominence within clinical assessment documentation
• Cognisance be given to the time commitment associated with a possible fail scenario
Future research

• National survey to establish how many students fail practice on clinical grounds
• Lecturer’s view of the tensions that exist
• Explore ‘borderline status’ in clinical assessment
• Further review and debate regarding clinical practice assessment tools
NMC Standards to Support Learning and Assessment in Practice

- Mentorship preparation
- Accountability and Assessment
- Sign off mentors
- Annual update & Triennial review
- Up-to-date local mentor register
- Ongoing achievement record
Practice Education Infrastructure in Scotland

2002
NES – Strategic Leadership for Practice Education

3 Regional Practice Education Coordinators

2004
Practice Education Facilitators (100 wte)

2010
Care Home Education Facilitators (14 wte)

2011
Practice Educators (12 wte)

Nurses and midwives in direct care giving roles

Nursing and midwifery mentors and newly qualified practitioners
Supporting the mentor role
Mentors need more support to fail poorly performing students

The Journal of Practice Teaching & Learning
Social Work • Health • Nursing

Special Issue ‘Failing Students’
Guest Editor Jo Finch

Volume 11(3) 2012/13
‘Failing’ literature

Gainsbury (2010)
- 37% of 1,945 mentors admitted they would not fail a student they had doubts about

Mead et al (2011)
- 10% of 94 mentors admitted they would not fail a student they had doubts about
- 30% answered yes to the statement ‘Paperwork is fudged and competencies ticked off without checking’
‘Failing’ literature

Brown (2012)

- 18% admitted they had passed a failing student
- The majority of these participants had rated their support as poor.

Reasons for passing

- Decision may be overturned
- Lack of confidence
- Not being able to prove concerns were valid
‘Failing’ literature

“Continued development of processes which support assessors to fail underperforming students is essential to promote public confidence”

Hunt et al (2012)
‘Failing’ literature

- Gainsbury (2010)
- Mead et al (2011)
- Heaslip and Scammell (2012)

Skingley et al (2007)

- Support mechanisms
- Lecturers play a role in assessment of students
- Lecturers record verbal concerns raised by practice teachers
‘Failing’ literature

- Gainsbury (2010)
- Mead et al (2011)
- Heaslip and Scammell (2012)

- Skingley et al (2007)
‘Failing’ literature

- Focus on helping mentors deliver difficult messages to underperforming students
- Development of the confidence of mentors
- Discuss the ways in which empathy, respect, sensitivity and dignity might be expressed in the clinical setting
- Encourage mentors to explore their own beliefs, expectations and prejudices

Jervis & Tilki (2011)
‘Failing’ literature

- Gainsbury (2010)
- Mead et al (2011)
- Heaslip and Scammell (2012)
- Skingley et al (2007)
- Jervis and Tilki (2011)
- Tanicala et al (2011)
- Black et al (2013)
- Larocque and Luhanga (2013)
Literature from other disciplines

- Dudek et al (2005)
- Frellsen et al 2008
- Cleland et al (2009)
- Finch (2009)
- Parker (2010)
- Basnett & Sheffield (2010)
- Furness (2011)

- Finch & Taylor (2013)
- Malihi-Shoja et al (2013)
- Poletti & Anka (2013)
- Rawles (2013)
- Schaub & Dalrymple (2013)
- Eno & Kerr (2013)
Mentor Preparation in Scotland

Core curriculum framework reviewed 2012

- Scoping of literature
- Arskey & O’Malley’s six stage process


- Updated evidence
- Outline process for the identification and selection of mentors
- Common understanding of supervising mentor role
- Guidance for mentors CPD

Mentorship literature

- Veeramah (2012)
- Chandan and Watts (2012)
- McLaren (2012)
Robinson et al (2012)

- Is the education of student nurses best served by a system in which all nurses are mentors or should the role be taken up as discrete career pathway by fewer nurses who have more dedicated time to spend with students?
- Can the mentoring needs of the numbers of students in practice settings be met by fewer mentors each spending more time with students or do student numbers preclude this option?
- How might the different approaches that have been advocated mesh with diverse practice settings and services and with the independent sector?
- What would be the implications for providing educational preparation for the role of mentors and senior mentors if the specialist, rather than the generic position, was adopted?
- Can mentorship be decoupled from a system in which it is the gateway to career progress?
- Is there a means by which relative costs of different models can be assessed?
Context of Practice
External Scrutiny
Raising and Escalating Concerns – guidance (NMC 2010)
“Mentoring is fundamental to patient safety” (NMC 2010)
Recommendations Mentorship preparation

2004
Include the topic of:
• dealing with a failed clinical assessment
• dealing with practical aspects and emotional reactions
• the formal processes

Failure early in the programme preferable to failure later in the programme

2014
• Explore the emotional aspects of failure
• Introduce the concepts of courage and resilience
• Consider the selection of mentors – choice?
• Coaching skills
• Constructive feedback skills
• Escalating concerns
• Role modelling

• Preparation for supervising mentors
Recommendations – Nursing programmes and providers

2004
• Tripartite arrangements to support mentors in their clinical assessment role
• Lecturers have a role in clinical assessment
• Debriefing with mentors after a failed assessment
• Passing on of information between placements
• Learning outcomes pertinent to professional behaviour and attitude be given prominence within clinical assessment documentation
• Cognisance be given to the time commitment associated with a possible fail scenario

2014
• Identify and support mentors who lack confidence to fail
• Tripartite arrangements to support mentors in their clinical assessment role
• Lecturers have a role in clinical assessment
• Debriefing with mentors after a failed assessment
• Cognisance be given to the time commitment associated with mentorship
Recommendations – Future Research & Debate

2004
- National survey to establish how many students fail practice on clinical grounds
- Lecturer’s view of the tensions that exist
- Explore ‘borderline status’ in clinical assessment
- Further review and debate regarding clinical practice assessment tools

2014
- Practice Education Facilitators’ views of the tensions that exist
- Explore ‘borderline status’ in clinical assessment
- Research regarding clinical practice assessment tools
- Student’s perspective
- Widespread debate and discussion regarding the challenges highlighted by Robinson et al (2012)
Your student............. Our future
References


References

- Larocque S, Luhanga FL (2013) Exploring the issue of failing to fail in a nursing program. International Journal of Nursing Education Scholarship. 10 1 1-8


• Rawles J (2013) Whose students are they anyway? Could a difference in how practice organisations and higher education institutions perceive social work students be a barrier to collaboration when problems arise in placement? Journal of Practice Teaching and Learning. 11 (3), 59-78.


